ADDENDUM: Competency-Based Promotion Criteria Examples

For promotion to Associate Professor, must:

1) Meet all Minimum Criteria (see below),

2) Demonstrate excellence in all 6 competencies with at least 3 unique elements in each competency category (individualized efforts not listed in examples will be considered as appropriate), and

3) Have evidence of regional level reputation/accomplishments in 2 competencies

For promotion to Professor, must:

1) Meet all Minimum Criteria (see below),

2) Demonstrate excellence in all 6 competencies with at least 5 unique elements in each competency category (individualized efforts not listed in examples will be considered as appropriate), and

3) Have evidence of national level reputation/accomplishments in 2 competencies

MINIMUM Criteria for initial appointment, continued appointment or consideration of promotion:

1) Board eligible (Assistant) or Board Certified (Associate, Professor) if applicable to discipline

2) Terminal Degree in discipline (MD, DO, PhD, PsyD, etc.)

3) Positive letters of support from colleagues, program director, trainees, etc.

4) Demonstration of excellent clinical performance determined by division/ department

5) Maintain citizenship & participation in collaborative relationships with health team members and within a UMN division

6) Timely completion of medical records and consults

7) Maintain current training as required for clinical care or clinical research (HIPPA, Good Practice, etc.)
ACGME Competency- Patient Care and Procedural Skills (PC)

“Patient care that is compassionate, appropriate, and effective for the treatment of health problems and the promotion of health.”

1) Strong local reputation among faculty and trainees for clinical excellence and service to patients (e.g., would be comfortable with candidate being physician for evaluator, family and loved ones)

2) Candidate is a recognized referral destination in his/her area of expertise locally and regionally

Criteria Examples

- Consistently high scores on patient satisfaction surveys
- Letters from patients/families
- Quality metrics of one’s own practice compare favorably with established benchmarks
- Creative, active achievement in the evaluation of the effectiveness of care (quality, outcomes, patient safety, utilization, access, cost)
- Creative participation/leadership role in developing innovations/development of new techniques, therapies, devices, patient care practices or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations, such as:
  - New service lines (Adoption Clinic, Telemedicine, Neuromuscular Multi-Disc Clinic, Transport, etc.)
  - Processes/programs within hospital or practice environment (QA/QI, safety, antimicrobial stewardship, blood management, disaster response planning, etc.)
  - Outreach effort changing referral practice
  - Improving communication systems internally and externally
- Clinical\Rotation Preceptor with favorable reviews
- Continuity Clinic Preceptor with favorable reviews
- Development of patient education materials, decision-making models or materials and innovations in care delivery that are recognized and/or used on local/regional/national level
- Invitations to teach skills or patient care at courses
- Participation in global medicine or outreach to underserved niche/area initiatives
ACGME COMPETENCY – Medical Knowledge (MK)

“Medical knowledge about established and evolving biomedical, clinical, and cognate (e.g., epidemiological and social behavioral) sciences, as well as application of this knowledge to patient care.”

1) Demonstrates “cutting-edge” technologies and knowledge in area of expertise; effectively transmits these new concepts to peers and trainees

2) Effective teacher of residents, students, other trainees, and colleagues

3) Participates in clinical research programs. This may include enrolling patients into clinical trials, analyzing clinical-pathological material, and contributing to design and analysis

4) Demonstrates involvement in transmitting clinical knowledge by giving lectures, teaching in postgraduate courses, and presenting symposia

5) Transmits new information as an author or co-author

Criteria Examples

- Maintenance of special provider licensing (BLS, PALS, NALS, ATLS, etc.), if applicable
- Organize/teach special provider licensing courses
- Present at local/regional/national symposium/GR/teaching invitations
- Organize local/regional/national meeting or symposium
- Provide/participate in Medical School, Dental School, Nursing School, etc. lectures
- Participation/Leadership of curriculum development for Medical School, Dental School, Nursing School, etc.
- Department or Affiliate Resident Teacher of the Year
- Department Resident Teacher of the Year nominee
- Gold Headed Cane Award
- Homer Venters Award
- Effective teaching evaluations from students and peers
- Participation/leadership in update or redevelopment of existing teaching materials for students, continuing education courses or faculty training
- Participation/leadership as a mentor on a training grant or on a mentoring committee (i.e. SOC, Master’s)
- Evidence of skills in mentoring to advance careers of more junior professionals, including: record of successful mentorship of students, residents, fellows or other faculty, as measured by: letters of support from mentees; publications, presentations, grants, awards or other evidence of mentees’ academic success; evidence that mentees have pursued outstanding careers
- Participation/leadership in development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational, websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops, etc.
- Successful leadership of local/regional/national continuing education courses
- Consistent participation in national educational activities (i.e.- residency/fellowship
review committees, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification courses or workshops)

- Evidence of participation/leadership in teaching scholarship (i.e. research, grants, publications or regional/national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, outcomes, innovations, etc. of teaching or adult education)
- Support clinical research (identify/enroll subjects, serve as medical advisor for research study, or assure study conduct performed in enrolled subjects, serve on DSMB)
- Participation/Leadership in clinical research (development of study, study initiation, study conduct, funding submission and/or analysis/authorship)
- Participation/leadership of guidelines, consensus statements, position papers
- Author/collaborator OR First/Last author of multicenter initiative publication
- Author/collaborator OR First/Last author of local initiative publication
ACGME COMPETENCY – Practice-Based Learning and Improvement (PBLI)

“Practice-based learning and improvement that involves the investigation and evaluation of patient care, the appraisal and assimilation of scientific evidence, and improvements in patient care.”

1) Demonstrates excellence in clinical outcomes

2) High level of patient satisfaction

3) Strong approval by referring physicians

Criteria Examples

- Consistently high scores on patient satisfaction surveys
- Letters from patients/families
- Quality metrics of one’s own practice compare favorably with established benchmarks
- Participation or leadership in significant self-assessment activities and audits leading to improvements in quality, efficiency or outcomes of care
- Author/collaborator -or- first/last author of published articles relating to quality improvement in health care
- Creative participation/leadership role in developing innovations/development of new techniques, therapies, devices, patient care practices or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations, such as:
  - New service lines (Adoption Clinic, Telemedicine, Neuromuscular Multi-Disc Clinic, Transport, etc.)
  - Processes/programs within hospital or practice environment (QA/QI, safety, antimicrobial stewardship, blood management, disaster response planning, etc.)
  - Outreach effort changing referral practice
  - Improving communication systems internally and externally
- Participation / leadership in development or revision of EMR systems: order sets, pathways, abstraction capabilities, etc.
- Participate / leadership in developing new practice guidelines and dissemination locally/ regionally/ nationally
- Active participation / leadership in development or execution of Safety Programs, Root Cause Analysis, Medication Safety, Antibiotic Stewardship, Blood Management, etc.
- Participation/ teaching/ development/ leadership of skill labs (Difficult Airway, End of Life Discussions, Ultrasound Diagnosis, etc.)
ACGME COMPETENCY – Interpersonal and Communication Skills (ICS)

“Interpersonal and communication skills that result in the effective exchange of information and collaboration with patients, their families, and other health professionals.”

1) Demonstrates excellence in ability to communicate effectively with other health care professionals

2) Demonstrates excellence in educating and counseling patients and families

Criteria Examples

- Superior results on 360 evaluations from peers
- Superior results on patient satisfaction surveys
- Letters from patients/families
- Regional or national-level presentations/courses on communication skills
- Participation/leadership at the site of clinical practice – e.g., Co-director/Director of a clinical service, Vice- or Director of Division, Vice- or Chair of Department, head of interdisciplinary team that creates and manages a clinical pathway and outcomes evaluation, Medical Staff President
- Participation/leadership in educational mission, including:
  - Director/Co-director residency program or fellowship program; Member/Chair, Intern Selection Committee, Member/Chair residency or fellowship Clinical Competency Committee, Member or Chair, Program Evaluation Committee
- Participation/leadership in culture and safety venues or simulations
- Chair/co-chair of MOC-IV Review Board
- Vice- or Chair/President of local/state/regional/national professional society chapter
- Substantive leadership role at the national or international level - e.g., chairing national symposia and meetings, chairing committees or serving as officer of national professional organizations, journal editor
- Associate Director/Director or Co-Director Residency or Fellowship Program
- Member, Chair/co-chair UMMCH Committee
- Media presence- frequent or standing interviews, newspaper articles or column, blog, medical correspondent or expert
- Active participation in teaching activities of the department, school, campus or university: presenting a series of lectures covering one or more topics; coordinating a course; acting as a primary instructor in a course; advising or mentoring students, residents or faculty; organizing or facilitating a seminar series, journal clubs or laboratory exercises; participating as a teacher in continuing education activities
- Effective teaching evaluations from students and peers
- Participation/leadership in update or redevelopment of existing teaching materials for students, continuing education courses or faculty training
- Participation as a mentor or investigator on a training grant
- Evidence of skills in mentoring to advance careers of more junior professionals, including record of successful mentorship of students, residents, fellows or other faculty, as measured by: letters of support from mentees; publications, presentations, grants, awards or other evidence of mentees’ academic success; evidence that mentees have pursued outstanding careers
• Participation / leadership in development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational, websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops, etc., implemented locally/regionally/nationally
• Successful leadership of local, regional or national continuing education courses
• Consistent participation in national educational activities (i.e. example, residency review committees, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification courses or workshops)
• Evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants, publications or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, or outcomes, of teaching) as participant or leader/co-leader
• Completion of advanced faculty development programs that result in a certificate/degree in education with evidence of new skills or knowledge applied to improve his/her teaching
ACGME COMPETENCY – Professionalism

“Professionalism, as manifested through a commitment to fulfilling professional responsibilities, adhering to ethical principles, and showing sensitivity to patients of diverse backgrounds.”

1) Maintains high standards of ethical behavior

2) Demonstrates exemplary sensitivity to age, gender, & culture of patients & health care professionals

Criteria Examples

- Maintenance of special provider skills licensing (BLS, PALS, NALS, ATLS, etc.)
- Organize/teach provider skills licensing course or curriculum
- Participation, teaching, development or leadership in equity and diversity curriculum, initiatives, studies or care models
- Participation, teaching, development or leadership of ethics or ethics-related curriculum, initiatives, studies or care models
- Faculty development curriculum participation, teaching, development or leadership
- Service to Department, Medical School or University on governance-related or policy-making committees, such as:
  - CSU Board, U of MN Senate, Promotions and Tenure Committee or other leadership committees including those at affiliated centers
- Leadership roles in service to Department, Medical School or university on governance-related or policy-making committees
- Roles (participation or leadership) in discipline-specific regional, national or international organization(s)
- Service or leadership in local, state, national or international or government organizations through education, consultation or other roles
- Service awards from the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific or professional)
- Appointment to leadership positions dealing with scientific, health care or educational issues at the local, state, regional, national or international levels
- Service as a member or leader of a scientific study section, or service as an editor or editorial board member of a professional or scientific journal
- Participation or leadership of activities or programs that address challenges in education, such as workforce diversity, training of providers or scholars, assessment of competencies or learning outcomes, mentorship, professionalism or educational technology
- Participation or leadership in health care advocacy, community service or outreach, community-based participatory research programs, or other activities that shape public policy on health care or that address health disparities
ACGME COMPETENCY – Systems Based Practice (SBP)

“Systems-based practice, as manifested by actions that demonstrate an awareness of and responsiveness to the larger context and system of health care, as well as the ability to call effectively on other resources in the system to provide optimal health care.”

1) Participates actively in local clinical practice committees; demonstrates leadership in these committees. Examples of such committees can be found in the individual departments, medical school, and clinical health system.

2) Develops a reputation for delivering high quality, cost-effective patient care.

3) Collaborates well with all members of the health care team to provide the best overall patient outcomes, care, and satisfaction.

Criteria Examples

- Participate/leadership to develop or disseminate clinical pathways
- Significant creation or development of programs to address or improve provider work-life balance
- Participation or leadership in significant self-assessment activities and audits of one’s own practice that have led to improvements in quality, efficiency or outcomes of care
- Creative, active achievement or leadership in the evaluation of the effectiveness of care (quality, outcomes, patient safety, utilization, access, cost)
- Demonstration of effective leadership at the site of clinical practice – e.g., director of a clinical service, head of a division, chair of a department, head of an interdisciplinary team that creates and manages a clinical pathway and outcomes evaluation, medical staff president
- Create or participate in division/departmental-level consensus conferences
- Participation or leadership in local, state, national or international or government organizations dealing with scientific, health care or educational issues through education, consultation or other roles
- Committee member: Transfusion, Infection Control, Pathogen Containment Unit, ECMO, Quality, Patient Safety, Med Exec, Credentialing, etc. (Division or Department minimum)
- Committee chair: Transfusion, Infection Control, Pathogen Containment Unit, ECMO, Quality, Patient Safety, Med Exec, Credentialing, etc. (Department, Medical School, University, Health System, etc.)
- Service awards from the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific or professional)